

# **EXHIBIT A**

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
EASTERN DISTRICT OF MICHIGAN  
SOUTHERN DIVISION

---

JACK REESE, JAMES CICHANOFSKY,  
ROGER MILLER and GEORGE NOWLIN  
on behalf of themselves and  
a similarly situated class,

Plaintiffs,

Vs.

Case No. 04-70592

CNH GLOBAL N.V., formerly  
known as Case Corporation,  
and CNH AMERICA LLC,

Defendants.

---

THE DEPOSITION OF SHARON SCHAEFFER

NOVEMBER 15, 2013

---

**COPY**

---

KEMPFER COURT REPORTING  
SARA R. ROGAN  
P.O. Box 510196  
Milwaukee, WI 53203  
(414) 272-2844  
1-800-725-9307

1 today?

2 A. No.

3 Q. I'm going to show you what's been  
4 marked as Exhibit 1.

5 MS. BRAULT: I did not shlep  
6 extra copies to the deposition so if you can  
7 share with her, Laura, that would be great.

8 Q. (BY MS. BRAULT) Exhibit 1 is a notice  
9 of deposition, and I'm just going to ask you  
10 if you've seen this document before?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. A signed copy?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. And it's indicated in Exhibit 1 that  
15 you should bring any and all documents used  
16 to calculate pension benefits for the Reese  
17 class, including but not limited to formulas,  
18 demographic data, contracts and plan  
19 documents. And it's my understanding that  
20 you have not brought those documents today?

21 A. Correct.

22 Q. Did you bring any documents with you  
23 today?

24 A. No.

25 Q. Do you have documents in your

1 possession that are described in the notice?

2 A. Well, we have plan documents. I  
3 personally don't have contracts. We have  
4 demographic data in employment and benefit  
5 files. We have formulas, but they're not  
6 documented formulas in a specific place where  
7 we could bring them.

8 Q. And the plans, do you still keep  
9 those in a file in your office like you did  
10 in 2005?

11 A. I don't have all the documents right  
12 in my office because of space, but we have  
13 them in our benefit area.

14 Q. In terms of finding the plan  
15 documents, I mean that would have been a  
16 matter of going to a file and getting them?

17 A. Pulling them together, yes.

18 Q. Could you just roughly estimate how  
19 long it would take you to find the plan  
20 documents?

21 A. Maybe a couple hours.

22 Q. Really? Couple of hours to find the  
23 plans in an office in your building?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. Do you have those plans scanned and

1 which year?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. And those would be things that you  
4 would use to formulate what the pension is  
5 going to be, correct?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. And that's all information that would  
8 be readily available to you in your office?

9 A. Yes.

10 MS. BRAULT: Laura, do you want  
11 to put your objection on the record regarding  
12 the duces tecum request because we did  
13 request that she bring those documents with  
14 her. I know you have an objection, if you  
15 want to state it.

16 MS. CAPOTOSTO: We do have an  
17 objection that you cannot <sup>get</sup> check by the 30-day  
18 rule by putting a request for documents in a  
19 notice of subpoena for a party, which  
20 Ms. Schaeffer is. Any documents that we have  
21 not already provided to plaintiffs, we have  
22 agreed, if they would like, to provide within  
23 the 30-day period.

24 MS. BRAULT: And my response to  
25 the objection is that explaining that two

1 days before the deposition was late since we  
2 sent the original notice on October 28th and  
3 the amended notice on November 8th, which  
4 incorporates the same duces tecum notice.

5 Q. (BY MS. BRAULT) I'm going to show you  
6 what's been marked as Exhibit 2,  
7 Ms. Schaeffer. Did you see the re-notice for  
8 the deposition?

9 A. I'm not sure.

10 MS. BRAULT: And that was served  
11 on November 8th. Both of the deposition  
12 notices have a duces tecum request. I think  
13 given the fact that Ms. Schaeffer could have  
14 easily complied with the request in a matter  
15 of hours, at most, or we could have had the  
16 deposition at Ms. Schaeffer's office, as I  
17 offered, that the reliant upon the 30-day  
18 rule is inefficient and not in keeping with  
19 the efficiencies of the rules of civil  
20 procedure.

21 Q. (BY MS. BRAULT) Having said that, I'm  
22 going to have you take a look at Exhibit 3,  
23 which is an email from myself to your  
24 counsel. I'm just going to ask you if you've  
25 ever seen that email before?

1 was.

2 Q. Okay. Was there some special formula  
3 that you had to put in for that or would it  
4 still have come up under the group in the  
5 retirees the way that you described?

6 A. I don't recall how we pulled them in.

7 Q. What's the significance of lower case  
8 versus upper case type?

9 A. I'm not sure you.

10 Q. You don't know?

11 A. I don't remember.

12 Q. But did you check it to make sure  
13 that it was correct?

14 A. We checked for reasonableness. We  
15 didn't go through and check each and every  
16 person.

17 Q. What do you mean you checked for  
18 reasonableness? What did you do to check for  
19 reasonableness?

20 A. We would have picked a few at random  
21 to make sure that information was what we  
22 expected it to be.

23 MS. CAPOTOSTO: I'm going to  
24 object on privilege. This was done at our  
25 direction. This is work product.

1 MS. BRAULT: I think I'm allowed  
2 to ask her if she checked to determine  
3 whether or not the information that was  
4 provided to us was accurate.

5 MS. CAPOTOSTO: Okay. Go ahead.

6 Q. (BY MS. BRAULT) And the few that you  
7 picked at random, were they all correct?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. Let's look at Mr. Abbott against this  
10 chart. So can you find Mr. Abbott on your  
11 chart?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. And what is his credited service?

14 A. 29.5.

15 Q. Now, if you look at the pension  
16 application, it's CNHA015613, what does that  
17 show for pension service date?

18 A. 30.5.

19 Q. And on the pension calculation chart,  
20 which is I think the next page, it shows him  
21 with 30.5 years of credited service?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. With 23.1 as of 6-30-94?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. And 7.4 of credited Case service?



1 A. Yes.

2 Q. And on the pension checklist, it  
3 shows that he had 30.5 years of credited  
4 service?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. And there's some handwritten note  
7 that says T 23.1 and C 7.4?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. What do those figures mean to you?

10 A. Tenneco is the pre-IPO service.

11 Q. So T is 23.1?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. That's Tenneco?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. And C is Case?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. And that's 7.4?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. Do you have an explanation for the  
20 discrepancy that's between his credited  
21 service that's shown in the file and the one  
22 that's indicated in the spreadsheet?

23 A. No.

24 Q. So one of them is wrong, right?

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. Which one do you think is wrong?

2 A. The one on the spreadsheet.

3 Q. Okay. So going back to the  
4 calculation sheet, Mr. Abbott retired on  
5 August 1st, 2001?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. Was there any reduction in his base  
8 benefit that he would receive after age  
9 sixty-two, either for age, credit of service,  
10 or an election of a spouse benefit?

11 A. No.

12 Q. And the pension rate at the time was  
13 39.45 per year of credited service, correct?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. And so his basic pension benefit that  
16 he would receive after the supplemental  
17 benefit terminated at age sixty-two would be  
18 calculated by multiplying his years of  
19 credited service by the pension rate of  
20 39.45, right?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. And the calculation shown on the  
23 upper right-hand corner of the sheet totals  
24 1,203.23?

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. Mr. Foxcroft -- keep that. You're  
2 going to want that and the spreadsheet. You  
3 can put Mr. Abbott back. I'm going to show  
4 you what's been marked as Exhibit Number 11,  
5 and this is for Mr. Foxcroft, and he is -- I  
6 don't know why I did that. If you look at  
7 his file, I'd like you to focus on the  
8 application for the pension benefits and the  
9 UAW pension calculations. And once you're  
10 oriented, let me know.

11 A. Okay.

12 Q. When did he retire?

13 A. March 1st, 2004.

14 Q. And he retired after the last annual  
15 increase to \$42 so he retired at the \$42  
16 rate?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. And the calculations then shown on  
19 that page would not be adjusted upward after  
20 that based upon an increase in rate?

21 A. Well --

22 Q. So --

23 A. Hold on a second. Let's see. It  
24 looks like he retired March 1st, but this has  
25 April 1st as \$42.

1 Q. Do you know if he received the lower  
2 rate for any period of time?

3 A. It looks like it was calculated at  
4 42. I don't know. I'd have to go back and  
5 look.

6 Q. After the 42, it would stay at that  
7 level though for life, correct?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. And the pension calculation sheet  
10 shows 35.7 years of credited service?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. And a base benefit at age sixty-two  
13 of 1,499.40?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. And I want you to look at the  
16 application, which is Bates stamp CNHA019559,  
17 and that shows a post-sixty-two benefit at  
18 1,306.20?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. And the Excel spreadsheet shows  
21 Mr. Foxcroft with 31.1 years of credited  
22 service?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. And if you multiply 31.1 times 42,  
25 you get 1,306.20?

1 A. What was it again? 42 times --

2 Q. 42 times 31.10.

3 A. 1,306.20. Yes.

4 Q. So it appears that the credited  
5 service number on the calculation sheet is  
6 not accurate, correct?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. On the pension calculation chart, it  
9 shows 14.1 years of credited Case service?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. So that was service after 6-30-94?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. And there aren't 14.1 years between  
14 6-30-94 and the date Mr. Foxcroft retired,  
15 correct?

16 A. Correct.

17 Q. Would there be a document somewhere  
18 that would show what the actual credited  
19 service would be for Mr. Foxcroft?

20 A. There could be a file document.

21 Q. What kind of file document could  
22 there be that isn't included in that file  
23 that we have for Mr. Foxcroft?

24 A. I don't know without looking.

25 Q. Now, it looks like he's deceased,

1 A. Well, the spreadsheet matches the  
2 application here.

3 Q. And it matches the spouse benefit at  
4 55 percent, right?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. How many discrepancies would you  
7 expect to see in the calculation sheets  
8 versus the spreadsheet that was provided to  
9 us?

10 A. I don't know.

11 Q. If you were reviewing this for  
12 acceptable amounts of error, what would you  
13 think would be an acceptable amount of error  
14 in a group of 2900 people, 2500 people?

15 A. I don't know.

16 Q. Would you expect to see as many as  
17 500 discrepancies like these that I've been  
18 showing you?

19 A. No.

20 Q. If it was more than 500, would that  
21 be a concern that we maybe don't have correct  
22 information?

23 A. I don't know.

24 Q. Okay. I also want to show you -- and  
25 looking back at that Excel spreadsheet, if

1 Q. So it's possible that you reported  
2 them directly to them?

3 A. It's possible. I don't recall.

4 Q. How would you have done that? Like  
5 in what form?

6 A. I don't recall. Probably a  
7 spreadsheet.

8 Q. Would you have kept those  
9 spreadsheets?

10 A. I don't know.

11 Q. Let's say if you did retain them,  
12 where would you have retained them?

13 A. If we had them, they would probably  
14 be in our office.

15 Q. And did you look for them?

16 A. No.

17 Q. On these N/As, I just want to clarify  
18 so I make sure that I understand this. This  
19 Excel spreadsheet was given to us as a way of  
20 coming up with or doing the calculations to  
21 get pension benefit information for these  
22 folks, and I'm trying to understand if you  
23 know of any way that for any of these people  
24 who are marked hash tag N slash A you can  
25 figure out what their pension -- what the

1 total pension benefit that they're receiving  
2 is?

3 A. From this spreadsheet?

4 Q. Yeah.

5 A. No.

6 Q. Because you don't have the Pactiv  
7 service to figure out what they received  
8 from -- or we don't have the total service  
9 basically?

10 A. Well, do we have -- I don't know if  
11 we have the other pieces of information  
12 either; for example, the date of retirement.

13 Q. Well, let me give you -- I'm going to  
14 have you look at the full sheet because I did  
15 take some columns out to try to understand  
16 the -- I think it was only addresses and  
17 things like that, but I'm going to give you  
18 what was given to us or at least I'm going to  
19 give you the first page of what was given to  
20 us.

21 MS. CAPOTOSTO: Should we mark  
22 that?

23 MS. BRAULT: I wasn't going to  
24 mark it, but we can.

25 MS. CAPOTOSTO: Yeah, let's mark



1 it.

2 MS. BRAULT: I don't have an  
3 extra copy though. We'll just use the first  
4 sheet and mark it.

5 (Whereupon, the above-mentioned  
6 document was marked as Exhibit 13.)

7 MS. BRAULT: I don't know if the  
8 date of retirement is on there. Maybe you  
9 can tell me.

10 MS. CAPOTOSTO: This is a full  
11 sheet of, what, Exhibit 10?

12 MS. BRAULT: This is the full  
13 sheet of the spreadsheet that was provided to  
14 us by your firm in response to our request  
15 for the pension benefit.

16 MS. CAPOTOSTO: Okay.

17 Q. (BY MS. BRAULT) Now, looking at --  
18 maybe if you can look at just one of the  
19 people who have a credited service of hash  
20 tag N back slash A. There should be somebody  
21 on the first page I think.

22 A. Okay.

23 Q. So can you tell me is there any  
24 way -- from the information that's contained  
25 on this spreadsheet, is there any way to

1 figure out what that person is receiving in  
2 terms of a pension benefit?

3 A. No.

4 Q. What other information would you need  
5 in order to get that information?

6 A. I would need the participant's date  
7 of retirement.

8 Q. What else?

9 A. The service and the pre-IPO service.

10 Q. Now, for people who don't have the  
11 hash tag N/A next to their name, can you tell  
12 from the information that you have for those  
13 folks what their total benefit is?

14 A. Are you asking if I can tell if it's  
15 correct?

16 Q. No. Can you tell what the total  
17 benefit is from the spreadsheet?

18 A. There's a benefit listed here.

19 Q. What is the benefit that's listed?  
20 Is that just the CNH portion or is it the  
21 full portion?

22 A. It's just the CNH portion.

23 Q. But if we have the Pactiv date of  
24 service, we could figure out what the Pactiv  
25 portion was, right?

1 guys gave us that supposedly has the correct  
2 information on it.

3 MS. CAPOTOSTO: It has the  
4 information from our system on it. Exhibit  
5 10?

6 MS. BRAULT: Looks like it, yep.

7 Q. (BY MS. BRAULT) Can you look up  
8 Judith Fisher? I had everything turned  
9 around when I copied these and hole-punched  
10 them on the wrong side.

11 So Judith Fisher is the retiree, not  
12 the spouse, correct?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. And what is her credited service date  
15 there?

16 A. Her date of retirement? 10-1-2001.

17 Q. And what are you showing in the  
18 file -- let's go to the file first for her  
19 total years of credited service.

20 A. 22.7.

21 Q. And what's in the spreadsheet?

22 A. 24.6.

23 Q. I want you to look next at Bernard  
24 Godfrey. He's the next person in that last  
25 exhibit. What does Mr. Godfrey's file show

1 in terms of his years of service?

2 A. 25.8.

3 Q. And what's in the Excel spreadsheet  
4 for him?

5 A. 21.7.

6 Q. So these are discrepancies clearly,  
7 correct?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. Do you have any explanation for why  
10 what was given us in the Excel spreadsheet is  
11 different from what's in the pension benefit  
12 file?

13 A. Well, I can only guess that the data  
14 that was loaded into the pension calculator  
15 was just loaded from our HR system. It  
16 doesn't have the most accurate up-to-date  
17 information because these people were already  
18 retired and receiving benefits.

19 Q. So you think -- which one do you  
20 think is more accurate?

21 A. These pages from the file.

22 Q. Okay. So you think that the  
23 information that was given to us in this  
24 spreadsheet is not good?

25 A. The information in our pension

1 calculator system for these people who had  
2 their benefits commence prior to us loading  
3 all the information into the pension  
4 calculator is not as up to date as these  
5 spreadsheets, as these calculation sheets.

6 Q. The ones that are in their benefits  
7 files?

8 A. Right.

9 Q. Well, just so you understand, this  
10 spreadsheet was given to us last month -- or  
11 September?

12 A. Correct.

13 Q. And it's only the people in our  
14 class, right?

15 A. That spreadsheet is only the people  
16 in the class.

17 Q. So it would have been only people who  
18 retired after -- or nobody in this group  
19 would have retired after -- was it November  
20 of 2004? I can find the date.

21 A. Right.

22 Q. April 1st, 2005. So nobody on that  
23 sheet retired before April 1st or everybody  
24 on that sheet retired before April 1st, 2005?

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. And it was printed in 2013?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. And your explanation for why the  
4 service dates might be wrong is because that  
5 data that that was pulled from isn't as  
6 reliable as the data in the printouts?

7 A. Correct.

8 Q. So on the instance where I showed you  
9 that the data in the pension file was what  
10 was incorrect and that Excel spreadsheet  
11 would have been an outlier, normally you  
12 think it would go the other way?

13 A. I would have to look at more  
14 examples.

15 Q. Okay. So Johnston, Shirley. Well,  
16 let's look at these two that we just looked  
17 at. Which do you think is the correct one?  
18 Do you think the correct service for Judith  
19 Fisher is in her pension file and not in the  
20 Excel spreadsheet?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. Why is that?

23 A. Because this is what we would have  
24 calculated the benefit on.

25 Q. Well, isn't that also true of the one

1 that we looked at earlier for Mr. -- not  
2 Mr. Hendrickson, not Mr. Abbott, but the  
3 other one. Mr. Foxcroft.

4 A. Okay. What was the question again?

5 Q. Didn't we determine that  
6 Mr. Foxcroft's personnel data was wrong and  
7 that the spreadsheet was right?

8 MS. CAPOTOSTO: Object to form.

9 Q. Remember him? We talked about him a  
10 couple hours ago?

11 A. I remember him.

12 Q. Okay.

13 A. I don't remember the circumstances.  
14 I would have to go back and check it.

15 Q. Okay. You can do that with  
16 Mr. Foxcroft. It's one of these exhibits  
17 here.

18 A. Well, I can't really tell from this  
19 spreadsheet which one is correct without  
20 doing an actual calculation for him.

21 Q. Yeah, that's kind of our problem  
22 too. We have both and we've had  
23 discrepancies and we don't have any way of  
24 figuring out which is right. You may have  
25 other resources to figure that out. What

1 would you look for?

2 A. I would go through a recalculation to  
3 see what we actually -- how we came up with  
4 the numbers and I would verify the service.  
5 I don't know if this is a complete file  
6 here.

7 Q. I'm sorry. Did you want to add  
8 something, Laura, because you're nodding your  
9 head and that's really not --

10 MS. CAPOTOSTO: My objection  
11 was --

12 MS. BRAULT: -- appropriate in a  
13 deposition.

14 MS. CAPOTOSTO: -- to form.  
15 Sorry for talking over you. My objection was  
16 to form and misstating -- you asked me why  
17 and to explain. You're misstating what the  
18 witness said because she said earlier that  
19 this may not be a complete file and it may be  
20 missing --

21 MS. BRAULT: No, I didn't say  
22 that.

23 MS. CAPOTOSTO: I think that's  
24 what she said earlier.

25 MS. BRAULT: That's what we were



1 service because his service looks peculiar.

2 Q. How would you do that?

3 A. I'd have to get an employment file or  
4 something and see when he actually worked  
5 there and verify what's correct here.

6 Q. And by employment file, you mean  
7 something different than what would in fact  
8 be in his benefits file?

9 A. It's hard to tell because I can't --  
10 I don't know if this is a complete file or  
11 not.

12 Q. And the reason you don't know that is  
13 because you don't have any access to your  
14 files right now?

15 A. Well, I don't have his file.

16 Q. If we were at your office, would you  
17 have access to look at his file?

18 A. I'm not sure because he left the  
19 company quite a long time ago, right? 2004.

20 Q. Yeah. So it might be hard to know  
21 where it is?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. Okay. So you would clearly need some  
24 more information to know whether or not the  
25 information contained in the benefits file is

1 wrong versus whether or not the spreadsheet  
2 information is wrong?

3 A. In this particular case, yes.

4 Q. And what about for Fisher, Judith  
5 Fisher? She was one of the first -- she was  
6 the first person in the compilation exhibit  
7 that's got a black -- or it had at least been  
8 put together with a binder clip. The one  
9 with all the pink tabbies on them. You might  
10 want to keep that clipped in order.

11 A. Okay. The information on this sheet  
12 is the most accurate.

13 Q. The pension calculation?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. And that's from the pension file --  
16 or the benefits file?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. And why are you saying that that's  
19 the most accurate?

20 A. Because this is the one that we used  
21 to do the calculation, etcetera, for payment.

22 Q. And so why would you think that the  
23 document that was provided to us in the Excel  
24 spreadsheet was inaccurate?

25 A. Because the information that was

1 you're saying that there's no other way to  
2 determine what is being paid to retirees in  
3 our class as pension benefits through CNH and  
4 Pactiv other than to go through each one of  
5 those benefits files?

6 MS. CAPOTOSTO: Object to form.

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. And that's how you'd do it if you had  
9 to do it, correct?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. Now, a number of these -- if you go  
12 back to the spreadsheet that was provided by  
13 counsel. I think it's --

14 A. This one?

15 Q. Yeah, the one you've got your hand on  
16 right now. Look down the column for Pactiv  
17 service. Do you see that there are a number  
18 of people who have no Pactiv service listed?

19 A. I don't see that column on here.

20 Q. I'm sorry.

21 MS. BRAULT: Go ahead and mark  
22 this.

23 (Whereupon, the above-mentioned  
24 document was marked as Exhibit 17.)

25 MS. BRAULT: You know what, I

1 think I've got this marked in error.

2 (Whereupon, Exhibit 17 was remarked.)

3 Q. (BY MS. BRAULT) This is the Abington,  
4 Donald W. Abington file. Can you look and  
5 tell me what his Pactiv service is from  
6 looking at his file?

7 A. I can't tell from these documents.

8 Q. Do you have a pension calculation  
9 sheet for him?

10 A. No.

11 Q. Do you think there's something more  
12 in his file that would show what the Pactiv  
13 service was?

14 A. I don't know without looking.

15 MS. BRAULT: Let's mark this one  
16 as 18.

17 (Whereupon, the above-mentioned  
18 document was marked as Exhibit 18.)

19 Q. So this is the file for Kenneth  
20 Adams. Can you tell me how many years of  
21 service he has with Pactiv?

22 A. It's not in this document either.

23 Q. Is it on the spreadsheets?

24 A. The Pactiv service isn't on here.

25 Q. Oh, right, it's not in that part.

1 Any explanation for why the benefits files  
2 would not contain the Pactiv service date for  
3 an employee or retiree?

4 MS. CAPOTOSTO: Object to form.

5 A. I didn't copy these files. I don't  
6 know if this is all that is in the file that  
7 we have in our office.

8 Q. Do you know why there would be no  
9 printout for the pension benefit calculation  
10 that we were looking at in some of the other  
11 files in a benefit file?

12 A. Well, both of these people were at  
13 the East Moline plant when it closed.

14 Q. Okay.

15 A. So it's possible that these  
16 calculations were done a little bit  
17 differently because neither of these two  
18 people were eligible to retire under the  
19 normal plan provisions. It looks like these  
20 folks were under the plant closing  
21 agreement.

22 Q. So does that mean that you would not  
23 have had a benefit calculation sheet for  
24 them?

25 A. Well, it means that when East Moline

1 closed, we had 500-some people all retiring  
2 all at the same time and the calculations  
3 were done a little bit differently.

4 Q. How were they done?

5 A. They were done by the pension  
6 calculator system as some sort of batch  
7 process.

8 Q. By whom?

9 A. By the Xerox system.

10 Q. Wouldn't the Xerox system then have  
11 to have their Pactiv service date?

12 A. It may have the Pactiv service for  
13 these people who had service after the  
14 calculator system was loaded in there.

15 Q. Well, wouldn't they need it for  
16 everybody who retired at that point in time?

17 A. For these 2004 retirees?

18 Q. Yeah. You said there were about  
19 500-plus people who retired at that time.

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. So Xerox would have had to have had  
22 their Pactiv service date?

23 A. They needed the Pactiv service  
24 amount, not necessarily the Pactiv service  
25 date.

1 Q. What do you mean by service amount?

2 A. The Pactiv service.

3 Q. So the years to credit towards  
4 Pactiv, right?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. Okay. Do you know how they received  
7 that, how Xerox received it?

8 A. No.

9 Q. Would you agree with me that it  
10 wouldn't really be possible to figure out  
11 what their pension benefit was without  
12 knowing what the Pactiv years were?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. So it may be that for some 500-plus  
15 people that we didn't get a Pactiv service  
16 number for them when we looked at their  
17 benefit files because it wasn't in there, it  
18 was done in a batch?

19 A. Okay.

20 Q. I mean is that possible?

21 A. I'm not sure what information you  
22 have.

23 Q. Okay. Well, the only information  
24 that we have about this group was what was  
25 provided in the Excel spreadsheet --